

**PLANNING AND LAND DEVELOPMENT  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES  
MONDAY, APRIL 26, 2021  
10:00 AM  
VIDEOCONFERENCE**

<b>Members Present:</b>	Councilmember Shirley Gonzales, Chair, <i>District 5</i> Councilmember Roberto Treviño, <i>District 1</i> Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan, <i>District 2</i> Councilmember John Courage, <i>District 9</i>
<b>Members Absent:</b>	Councilmember Rebecca Viagran, <i>District 3</i>
<b>Staff Present:</b>	Jameene Williams, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Susan Guinn, <i>Assistant City Attorney</i> ; Verónica R. Soto, <i>Director, Neighborhood &amp; Housing Services Department</i> ; Ian Benavidez, <i>Assistant Director, Neighborhood &amp; Housing Services Department</i> ; Sara Wamsley, <i>Housing Policy Manager, Neighborhood &amp; Housing Services Department</i> ; Aurora Perkins, <i>Deputy City Clerk</i> ; Colton Powell, <i>Neighborhood &amp; Housing Services Department</i> ; Robert Rinn, <i>City Manager's Office</i> .
<b>Others Present:</b>	None

**1. Approval of the Minutes for the March 29, 2021 Planning & Land Development Council Committee (PLDC) Meeting.**

Councilmember Courage moved to approve the Minutes of the March 29, 2021 Planning & Land Development Council Committee Meeting. Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously by those present.

**Public Comment**

None.

**Consent Agenda**

**2. Briefing on the City's Strategic Housing Implementation Plan (SHIP) progress including the definition of affordability and next steps.** [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Verónica R. Soto, FAICP, Director, Neighborhood and Housing Services]

Ian Benavides provided an update on the Strategic Housing Implementation Plan (SHIP). He noted that the SHIP had made progress in the completion of the following components:

- Recalibration of target goals: 95% completed
- Definition of Affordability: 99% completed
- Development of Funding Plan: 50% completed
- Implementation Plan Development: 50% completed

Mr. Benavides stated that the Housing Commission recommended definition of affordability as follows:

Program Type	AMI Served						
	0-15%	16-30%	31-50%	51-60%	61-80%	81-100%	Up to 120%
Rental Development & Preservation Programs such as loans, grants, or tax credits	Critically Affordable	Deeply Affordable	Fairly Affordable	Affordable	Moderate Rate	Median Rate	Market Rate
Homeownership Development & Preservation programs such as loans, grants, CLT and MHP support	Deeply Affordable				Affordable		

Mr. Benavides provided a description of infographic materials which would be used to demonstrate or explain the Area Median Income (AMI) levels to the general public. The graphics provided information of individual household income levels (annual and hourly) and associated occupations. He noted that 70% of all households in the City were included in AMI ranges up to 120%. He reviewed the number of households for each category within the City identified in the infographic.

Mr. Benavides stated that the community need for housing identified a total of 500,000 total households in Bexar County. He noted that there were 170,000 cost burdened households that paid more than 30% of household income on housing. He identified 95,667 households as most vulnerable due to such factors as low education, concentration of low-income housing, unemployment, supply, and demand components, and overcrowding of housing. He added that the SHIP's target housing unit goals were recalibrated from 18,681 to 47,833, with 38,977 of the housing units to be in the affordable category and 8,856 in the median market category.

Mr. Benavides reviewed the stakeholder forums categories and committee chairs and co-chairs as follows:

- Real Estate & Development – Pedro Alanis (San Antonio Housing Trust) and Veronica Garcia (Center City Development and Operations Department)
- Residents & Community – Juan Valdez (Mayor's Office) and Jessica Guerrero (Housing Commission)
- Affordable Housing Providers – Kristina Davila (Merced Housing Texas) and Tim Alcott (San Antonio Housing Agency)
- Housing Policy – Jim Bailey (Alamo Architects) and Christine Vine (VIA Transit)

Mr. Benavidez noted that the stakeholder forums had four areas of concentration which recommendations were being built on related to the SHIP strategies:

- Affordable Housing Community
- Housing Policy
- Real Estate & Development

- Residents & Community

Mr. Benavides noted that the committees would circulate their proposed recommendation drafts to other policy stakeholder forums for feedback. He stated that after this process the revised drafts would be submitted to the full SHIP group, the Housing Commission and the Planning and Land Development Council Committee for review.

Committee Chair Gonzales asked who recommended the development of the infographic communication pieces. Mr. Benavides stated that City staff had initially created the communication piece to provide a visual for practitioners and policymakers and to the average person not familiar with the topic. He added that the Housing Commission provided positive feedback on the communication pieces.

Committee Chair Gonzales asked why further breakdown of categories in communication pieces were not considered. Mr. Benavides stated that the breakdown had been considered in the initial development but that based on feedback from the Housing Commission, they thought it best that the pieces were made more inclusive with larger terms and categories. He stated that the requested terms could be incorporated into the communication materials.

Councilmember Treviño stated that he supported the presented definitions of affordability. He noted that the City and housing partners would need to be more dynamic when building housing to the lower AMI levels and that housing projects containing a majority of units in the zero to 30% AMI range would be the norm.

Councilmember Treviño asked if the definition of affordability at each AMI level would apply to the Housing Bond in 2022 if Proposition A was passed by the voters. Mr. Benavides stated that the idea behind the definitions and target goals was to relate them to funding sources strategies which would include the Housing Bond.

Councilmember Treviño asked if the SHIP Committee and Housing Commission played a role in the development of bond issues at the Housing Commission. Mr. Benavides stated that the Housing Commission would be involved, but the SHIP would make recommendations to the City Council and then cease to exist once the policy was adopted by the City Council. He added that once the SHIP transitioned, the Housing Commission would assume responsibility and would report to the Council Committee that oversaw housing issues.

Councilmember Treviño asked if families that experienced homelessness and those within the critically to deeply affordable range participate in the forums. Mr. Benavides confirmed that residents that experienced homelessness and other housing issues were included in the partner forums. He added that the resident comments and insight was provided to the SHIP, Housing Commission and the ultimately the Council Committee. Councilmember Treviño requested that the Housing First Coalition be included in the Housing Developer forum.

Councilmember Treviño asked if the SHIP goals were aligned with those of the Homeless Strategic Plan. Mr. Benavides confirmed that they were and had overlap in many areas to include permanent supportive housing. Councilmember Treviño asked when the Homeless Strategic Plan would be voted on by the City Council. Mr. Benavides stated that he would obtain the information but that the SHIP was tentatively scheduled for June 2021. Councilmember Treviño requested that the Homeless Strategic Plan be presented to City Council at the same time.

Councilmember Courage expressed concern related to only addressing half of the 95,000 vulnerable households within the next 10 years and leaving many households unassisted. Mr. Benavides stated that the SHIP goals were set to be realistic in capacity. He noted that under SHIP the City's goal was double of the previous goal of 18,000. Mr. Benavides stated that feasibility limitations could prevent assisting more households, but that staff and partners were prepared to adjust goals as needed if additional funding was identified.

Councilmember Courage asked how many units had been built that included affordable with market rate housing within the last 10 years. Mr. Benavides stated that he would provide the information once obtained. Councilmember Courage asked that staff plan ahead for an increase in housing in the instance that additional funding became available.

Councilmember Courage asked if there was an identified cost to the building or providing of 47,000 units. Mr. Benavides stated that the SHIP was currently evaluating with hired consultant, staff, partners, and developers and would have analysis completed within next two weeks. He noted that the current costs of building materials and post-COVID 19 conditions were being evaluated and considered.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan asked if an inventory had been conducted to identify housing at each AMI level. Mr. Benavides stated that the data had been incorporated into the recalibration of goals and he would provide the data to the Committee.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan asked if a cost analysis had been conducted on the costs associated with rehabilitation, refurbishing, or reposing of buildings to provide as housing. Mr. Benavides stated that conversations had been conducted with new building and rehabilitation developers which identified targeted costs for each program. He added that analysis would be provided for both rehabilitation target versus new construction targets along with associated strategies to meet the targets.

Councilmember Andrews-Sullivan asked if the Homeless Strategic Plan would address open bay areas with shower facilities and other amenities for individuals that did not want to go into traditional housing. Mr. Benavides stated that the Plan did not address that, but staff would discuss with the Department of Human Services to coordinate possible efforts.

**3. Briefing on the Housing Commission's Annual Retreat held on April 7, 2021 [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Verónica R. Soto, FAICP, Director, Neighborhood and Housing Services]**

Mr. Benavides stated that the Housing Commission retreat had occurred on April 7, 2021 at Phil Hardberger Park Urban Ecology Center with virtual public comment available. He noted the retreat goals as follows:

- Finalize the definition of affordable housing
- Initiate conversation on formal subcommittees and meeting structure
- Reconnect with the housing mission and one another

Mr. Benavides stated that the Housing Commission established guidelines in the establishment of a definition of affordability:

- Singular terms used to describe affordable housing
- Reviewed over several full Commission meetings and group briefings
- Would be incorporated into the SHIP

Mr. Benavides provided an overview of the Housing Commission's recommendation as diagrammed:

Program Type	AMI Served						
	0-15%	16-30%	31-50%	51-60%	61-80%	81-100%	Up to 120%
Rental Development & Preservation Programs such as loans, grants, or tax credits	Critically Affordable	Deeply Affordable	Fairly Affordable	Affordable	Moderate Rate	Median Rate	Market Rate
Homeownership Development & Preservation programs such as loans, grants, CLT and MHP support	Deeply Affordable				Affordable		

Mr. Benavides noted that the Commissioners would draft a statement to accompany their definition of affordability. He stated that the projected audience would be the general public and policy makers who would use the definition. He added that the Commission's goals would be to: 1) Provide more context on the intent behind the definition of affordability and 2) Communicate shared values and goals for housing.

Mr. Benavides noted that the Housing Committee elected to create two new subcommittees which were the Dashboard & Annual Report Committee and the Public Engagement & Outreach Committee. He stated that the new committees would provide additional opportunities to obtain public comment or provide communications to the public. Mr. Benavides provided examples of other City commissions that utilized subcommittees that focused on particular tasks and provided guidance and deliverables to the reporting Commission.

Mr. Benavides reviewed the next steps of the Housing Commission which included:

- Selection of Commissioners to work on committee structure and guidelines for charge and membership
- Commissioners to report back to Commission for recommendations approval (May 2021)

Councilmember Treviño thanked the Housing Commission for their work on the Plan and was supportive of the proposed dashboard. He requested that the dashboard provided a chart or visual indicator of the number of units needed at each of the seven AMI levels.

Councilmember Courage asked if there had been any discussion related to the Renters Commission at the housing retreat. Mr. Benavides stated that there had not been any discussion.

## **Adjourn**

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 10:45 AM.

---

***Shirley Gonzales, Chairwoman***

***Respectfully submitted,***

---

***Aurora Perkins***  
***Office of the City Clerk***

DRAFT