



City of San Antonio

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 19-7802

Type: Zoning Case

In control: Board of Adjustment

On agenda: 10/21/2019

Title: BOA-19-10300118: A request by David Rodriguez for appeal of the Historic Preservation Officer's decision to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness, located at 1418 West Rosewood Avenue. Staff recommends Denial. (Council District 1) (Huy Pham, Historic Preservation Specialist, (210) 207-5469, huy.pham@sanantonio.gov, Office of Historic Preservation) (Dominic Silva, Senior Planner (210) 207-0120, dominic.silva@sanantonio.gov, Development Services Department)

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. BOA-19-10300118 Application, 2. BOA-19-10300118 Attachments

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

Case Number: BOA-19-10300118

Applicant: David Rodriguez

Owner: David Rodriguez

Council District: 1

Location: 1418 W ROSEWOOD AVE

Legal: Lot 8, Block 68, NCB 2763

Description:

Zoning: "R-4 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Keystone Park
Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District

Case Manager: Huy Pham, Historic Preservation Specialist, OHP; Dominic Silva, Senior Planner, DSD

Request

An appeal of the Historic Preservation Officer's decision to deny window replacement and fenestration modifications as proposed for the property at 1418 West Rosewood.

Applicable Code References

Historic Design Guidelines

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*-Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or

air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Doors*-Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

iii. *Windows*-Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

iv. *Screens and shutters*-Preserve historic window screens and shutters.

v. *Storm windows*-Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*-Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

ii. *New entrances*-Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.

iii. *Glazed area*-Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.

iv. *Window design*-Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

v. *Muntins*-Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

vi. *Replacement glass*-Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

vii. *Non-historic windows*-Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

viii. *Security bars*-Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.

ix. *Screens*-Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

x. *Shutters*-Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

Background and Interpretation

The structure at 1418 W Rosewood was constructed circa 1925 with Tudor influences and first appears on the 1951 Sanborn map. The one story structure features vinyl siding over wood lap siding, steep front-facing and turned gables, a subtle sweeping curve front porch cover, and an original porte-cochere. The property contributes to the Keystone Park Historic District.

Staff conducted a site visit on July 2, 2019, and found that the property was subjected to a number of fenestration modifications including door removal and window relocation in the rear side bay as well as the installation of aluminum windows throughout the structure. A number of wood windows and an original door were visible on the site at the time of the site visit. Because work was completed without first obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness, the applicant was prompted to request approve from the Historic and Design Review Commission as an option to remedy the violation.

On August 2, 2019, staff received a Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) application from the

applicant for the window replacement and fenestration modifications to be heard at the next available hearing. At the hearing on August 21, 2019, the HDRC referred the request to a Design Review Committee (DRC, subcommittee) site visit. At the site visit with the DRC on August 28, 2019, subcommittee members informed the applicant that wholesale wood window replacement with new vinyl or aluminum windows would not be supported by the present subcommittee members and advised the applicant to resubmit a request that maintains the original window sizes, locations, and materials. The applicant indicated to OHP staff that he preferred to appeal to the Board of Adjustment rather than pursuing a remedy through HDRC approval. OHP staff issued a denial letter which cites non-conformance with the Historic Design Guidelines.

Staff Recommendation to the Board of Adjustment

Staff recommends that the Board of Adjustment uphold the decision by the Historic Preservation Officer to deny window replacement and fenestration modifications as proposed for the property at 1418 W Rosewood.